1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 22 23 24 25 26 27	Timothy D. McGonigle, Esq. (State Bar No TIMOTHY D. McGONIGLE PROF. COR 1880 Century Park East, Suite 516 Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 478-7110 Facsimile: (888) 266-9410 tim@mcgoniglelaw.net George G. Braunstein, Esq. (SBN 134602) Clark Anthony Braunstein, Esq. (SBN 278 BRAUNSTEIN & BRAUNSTEIN, P.C. 11755 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 2140 Los Angeles California 90025 Telephone: (310) 914-4999 george@braunsteinpc.com clark@braunsteinpc.com clark@braunsteinpc.com Attorneys for Plaintiffs, American Airliness Pilots Coalition, Gregory R. Cordes, Dru M Doug Poulton, Stephan Robson and Philip and the Class UNITED STATES D NORTHERN DISTR AMERICAN AIRLINES FLOW-THRU PILOTS COALITION, et al., Plaintiffs, v. ALLIED PILOTS ASSOCIATION et al. Defendants.	P.) 023) Flow-Thru Aarquardt, Valente III
	Plaintiffs' Unopposed Ex Parte Application For Entry C Am. Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied Pilo	1 Of Stipulated Protective Order ;

1	TO THE COURT, ALL PARTIES AND COUNSEL OF RECORD:	
2	PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Plaintiffs American Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots	
3 4	Coalition, Gregory R. Cordes, Dru Marquardt, Doug Poulton, Stephan Robson and	
4 5	Philip Valente III, individually and on behalf of a class of similarly situated pilots	
6	(collectively, "Plaintiffs") will and hereby do move ex parte for entry of a stipulated	
7	protective order filed concurrently herewith.	
8 9	Entry of the proposed stipulated protective order will assist Plaintiffs to	
10	complete their discovery efforts in advance of the upcoming deadline for	
11	disclosure of expert reports. The parties have met and conferred and entry of the	
12 13	stipulated protective order on an <i>ex parte</i> basis is agreeable to all parties.	
14	McGonigle Decl. at	
15	For these reasons, Plaintiffs respectfully request entry of the proposed	
16 17	stipulated protective order forthwith.	
17	This application is based on this Notice, the accompanying Memorandum of	
19	Points and Authorities, the accompanying Declaration of Timothy McGonigle, Esq., any	
20	reply papers, all other papers on file in this action, all materials that may be properly	
21 22	considered in connection with this application, and oral argument at any hearing on this	
22 23	matter.	
24		
25		
26		
27		
28	2 Plaintiffs' Unopposed Ex Parte Application For Entry Of Stipulated Protective Order ; Am. Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied Pilots Assn., Case No. 3:15-cv-03125 RS	

1	DATED: June 21, 2019
2	
3	TIMOTHY D. MCGONIGLE PROF. CORP.
4	
5	By: <u>/s/ Timothy D. McGonigle</u> Timothy D. McGonigle
6	
7	BRAUNSTEIN & BRAUNSTEIN, P.C.
8	By: <u>/s/ George Braunstein</u>
9	George Braunstein
10	Attorneys for Plaintiffs, American Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots
11	Coalition, Gregory R. Cordes, Dru Marquardt, Doug Poulton, Stephan Robson and Philip Valente III and the
12	Class
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	3
	Plaintiffs' Unopposed Ex Parte Application For Entry Of Stipulated Protective Order ; Am. Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied Pilots Assn., Case No. 3:15-cv-03125 RS

1 **MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES** 2 I. **INTRODUCTION** 3 4 The instant *Ex Parte* Application of Plaintiffs American Airlines Flow-Thru 5 Pilots Coalition, Gregory R. Cordes, Dru Marquardt, Doug Poulton, Stephan Robson 6 and Philip Valente III and the Class (collectively, "Plaintiffs") will assist Plaintiffs in 7 their discovery efforts and may prevent substantial prejudice to Plaintiffs' ability to 8 9 prosecute their claims. Counsel for defendants have requested entry of the proposed 10 stipulated protective order (McGonigle Decl. at ¶__) which no parties have opposed. 11 As a result, in order to prevent any possible delay in the further prosecution of this case, 12 Plaintiffs respectfully request entry of the proposed stipulated protective order 13 14 submitted herewith, which is not opposed by any party. Id. 15 16 II. FACTUAL AND PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND 17 18 The named plaintiffs in this action are five individual pilots and an association of 19 more than 150 similarly-situated pilots who originally were employed by an airline 20 21 named "American Eagle"— a collective name for several regional affiliates of 22 American Airlines ("AAL"). In 1997, American Eagle pilots became eligible to 23 become pilots at AAL by virtue of a so-called "Flow-Thru Agreement" - (hereinafter 24 referenced as the "FTP Pilots.") Plaintiffs contend that defendant Allied Pilots 25 26 Association (the "APA") breached its duty of fair representation by, among other things, 27 28 4 Plaintiffs' Unopposed Ex Parte Application For Entry Of Stipulated Protective Order ; Am. Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied Pilots Assn., Case No. 3:15-cv-03125 RS

1 regularly and repeatedly acting against the interests of the FTP Pilots as to their terms 2 and conditions of employment at AAL, by acting to advance the interests of other pilot 3 groups as to the terms and conditions of employment at AAL contrary to the interests of 4 the FTP Pilots and without taking account of the interests of the FTP Pilots. 5 6 This Court recently extended the expert witness deadlines; and Plaintiffs have 7 been working with counsel for defendants on obtaining discovery needed for Plaintiffs' 8 expert; meanwhile counsel for defendant APA has requested that Plaintiffs enter into the 9 proposed stipulated protective order that is being filed concurrently herewith. 10 11 McGonigle Decl. at ¶3. 12 **III. THE PROPOSED STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER IS SUPPORTED** 13 BY GOOD CAUSE -- THOUGH A FINDING OF GOOD CAUSE IS NOT A 14 PREREQUISITE TO ENTRY OF SUCH AN ORDER 15 "While courts generally make a finding of good cause before issuing a protective 16 order, a court need not do so where (as here) the parties stipulate to such an order." In re 17 Roman Catholic Archbishop of Portland in Oregon, 661 F.3d 417, 424 (9th Cir. 2011). 18 19 That is precisely the case here, meaning no finding of good cause is necessary. But, 20 good cause nevertheless exists to enter the proposed stipulated protective order because 21 entry of the proposed stipulated protective order appears likely to assist Plaintiffs in 22 their efforts to meet the deadlines in this case; and is not opposed by any party. 23 24 McGonigle Decl. at ¶4. 25 Plaintiffs are aware that *ex parte* applications are solely for extraordinary relief 26 and are discouraged. However, given the urgent need for discovery prior to the lapse of 27 28 5 Plaintiffs' Unopposed Ex Parte Application For Entry Of Stipulated Protective Order ; Am. Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied Pilots Assn., Case No. 3:15-cv-03125 RS

1 the upcoming expert witness deadlines, there is insufficient time for Plaintiffs to make 2 this request via a regularly noticed motion. 3 In Mission Power Eng'g Co. v. Continental Casualty Co., 883 F. Supp 488, 492 4 (C.D. Cal. 1995), the court set forth a two-part test to determine whether a moving party 5 6 is entitled to *ex parte* relief: the moving party must show (1) that its "cause will be 7 irreparably prejudiced if the underlying motion is heard according to regular noticed 8 motion procedures"; and (2) that the moving party is "without fault in creating the crisis 9 that requires ex parte relief, or that the crisis occurred as a result of excusable neglect." 10 11 Both prongs are met here as Plaintiffs will be irreparably harmed should this request be 12 made on regular notice -- as there is insufficient time in which to have a motion heard 13 on regular notice prior to the expiration of the expert disclosure deadline. 14 Had Plaintiff's prior counsel not abandoned the class, this relief would never 15 16 have been required. And, if attorney abandonment is enough to grant Rule 60(b) relief 17 after a final judgment (and it is), it is plainly good cause to grant the short delay in the 18 expert witness schedule sought by Plaintiffs under these circumstances. See Community 19 Dental Servs. v. Tani, 282 F.3d 1164, 1170 (9th Cir. 2002) as amended on denial of 20 21 reh'g and reh'g en banc (Apr. 24, 2002) (where the Ninth Circuit joined the majority of 22 the other circuits to hold that an attorney's gross negligence is an extraordinary 23 circumstance that is a ground for equitable relief under Rule 60(b)(6)). 24 25 26 27 28 6 Plaintiffs' Unopposed Ex Parte Application For Entry Of Stipulated Protective Order ; Am. Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied Pilots Assn., Case No. 3:15-cv-03125 RS

1	IV. CONCLUSION	
2	For all of the above-stated reasons, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court	
3	enter the stipulated protective order submitted concurrently herewith.	
4 5		
6	DATED: June 21, 2019	
7		
8	TIMOTHY D. MCGONIGLE PROF. CORP.	
9		
10	By: <u>/s/ Timothy D. McGonigle</u> Timothy D. McGonigle	
11		
12	BRAUNSTEIN & BRAUNSTEIN, P.C.	
13	By: <u>/s/ George Braunstein</u>	
14 15	George Braunstein	
16	Attorneys for Plaintiffs, American Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition, Gregory R. Cordes, Dru Marquardt, Doug	
17	Poulton, Stephan Robson and Philip Valente III, and the Class	
18	Class	
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24 25		
23 26		
27		
28	7	
	Plaintiffs' Unopposed Ex Parte Application For Entry Of Stipulated Protective Order ; Am. Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied Pilots Assn., Case No. 3:15-cv-03125 RS	

1	Timothy D. McGonigle, Esq. (State Bar No. 115979)	
2	TIMOTHY D. McGONIGLE PROF. CORP.	
3	1880 Century Park East, Suite 516	
4	Los Angeles, California 90067	
5	Telephone: (310) 478-7110	
6	Facsimile: (888) 266-9410	
7	tim@mcgoniglelaw.net	
8	George G. Braunstein, Esq. (SBN 134602)	
9	Clark Anthony Braunstein, Esq. (SBN 278023)	
10	BRAUNSTEIN & BRAUNSTEIN, P.C.	
11	11755 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 2140	
12	Los Angeles California 90025	
13	Telephone: (310) 914-4999	
14	george@braunsteinpc.com	
15	clark@braunsteinpc.com	
16	clark@braunsteinpc.com	
 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 		

1 **DECLARATION OF TIMOTHY MCGONIGLE** 2 I. Timothy McGonigle, declare under penalty of perjury: 3 4 1. I am an attorney for Plaintiffs American Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots 5 Coalition, Gregory R. Cordes, Dru Marquardt, Doug Poulton, Stephan Robson 6 7 and Philip Valente III and the Class in this action. I am an attorney at law duly 8 licensed to practice before this Court and all of the courts of the State of 9 California. I am submitting this declaration in support of plaintiffs' Ex Parte 10 11 Application to Continue Expert Deadlines. I have personal knowledge of the 12 following matters, except to the extent otherwise indicated. If called as a 13 witness, I could and would competently testify to the truth thereof under oath. 14 15 2. Following this Court's Order resetting the expert witness deadlines 16 dated April 18, 2019 [Dkt. No. 162], I have been engaged in analyzing the issues 17 of this case, and working with certain of the named class members and Mr. Keitt 18 19 "Kit" Darby, the Plaintiffs' damage expert, to determine what information is 20 reasonably required in order to prosecute Plaintiffs' case, including the 21 preparation of his expert report. I firmly believe that Plaintiffs can make a strong 22 23 showing of the need for certain narrowly targeted discovery, and that such 24 discovery is necessary in order to adequately prosecute the case on behalf of 25 26 named Plaintiffs and also on behalf of the absent class members. 27 2 28 McGonigle Dec. In Support Of Plaintiffs' E.P. App. For Entry Of Stipulated Protective Order;

Am. Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied Pilots Assn., Case No. 3:15-cv-03125 RS

3. I have been working with counsel for defendants on obtaining discovery needed for Plaintiffs' experts and Mr. Rosenthal has requested that Plaintiffs enter into the proposed stipulated protective order that is being filed concurrently herewith. Counsel for the APA does not oppose the instant ex parte application.

Entry of the proposed stipulated protective order appears likely to 4. assist Plaintiffs in their efforts to meet the deadlines in this case; and is not opposed by any party.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States and the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief.

By:

Dated this June 21, 2019 at Los Angeles, California.

Ton Mibil

Timothy D. McGonigle

	Case 3:15-cv-03125-RS Document 167-2	Filed 06/21/19 Page 1 of 13
1 2	UNITED STATES	S DISTRICT COURT
3	NORTHERN DISTR	ICT OF CALIFORNIA
4 5 6 7 8	AMERICAN AIRLINES FLOW-THRU PILOTS COALITION, <i>et al.,</i> Plaintiffs, v.	Case No. 3:15-cv-03125-RS STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER FOF STANDARD LITIGATION
9	ALLIED PILOTS ASSOCIATION, <i>et al.</i> , Defendants.	
10		
11	1. <u>PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS</u>	
12	Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of	
13	confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure	
14	and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly,	
15	the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective	
16	Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosure	
17	or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends	
18	only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the	
19	applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that	
20	this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal;	
21	Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be	
22	applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.	
23	2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>	
24	2.1 <u>Challenging Party</u> : a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or	
25	items under this Order.	
26	2.2 <u>"CONFIDENTIAL"</u> Information	or Items: information (regardless of how it is
27	generated, stored or maintained) or tangible thing	s that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of
28	Stipulated Protective Order, AA Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition	<i>v. APA</i> , Case No. 3:15-cv-03125-RS 1

Civil Procedure 26(c).

2 2.3 <u>Counsel (without qualifier)</u>: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well
3 as their support staff).

2.4 <u>Designating Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it
5 produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL."

2.5 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u>: all items or information, regardless of the medium
or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony,
transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to
discovery in this matter.

10 2.6 <u>Expert</u>: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to
11 the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a
12 consultant in this action.

13 2.7 <u>House Counsel</u>: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House
14 Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

15 2.8 <u>Non-Party</u>: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal
16 entity not named as a Party to this action.

17 2.9 <u>Outside Counsel of Record</u>: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action
18 but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action on
19 behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

20 2.10 <u>Party</u>: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,
21 consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

22 2.11 <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery
23 Material in this action.

24 2.12 <u>Professional Vendors</u>: persons or entities that provide litigation support services
 25 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing,
 26 storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

27 28 2.13 <u>Protected Material</u>: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as

3

4

"CONFIDENTIAL."

2.14 <u>Receiving Party</u>: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. <u>SCOPE</u>

5 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as 6 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all 7 copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, 8 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. 9 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving 10 11 Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of 12 publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record 13 through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the 14 disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the 15 information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party.

16

4

DURATION

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

23

5.

DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 <u>Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection</u>. Each Party or
 Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to
 limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The
 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or

oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents,
 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within
 the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown
to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily
encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on
other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

8 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for
9 protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties
10 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order
(see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,
Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so
designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

15

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

16 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but 17 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party 18 affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material or, for native 19 digital files, otherwise clearly designate the files with the label "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must 20 21 clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins). 22 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not 23 designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would 24 like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made 25 available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has 26 identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which 27 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the

28

Stipulated Protective Order, AA Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. APA, Case No. 3:15-cv-03125-RS

Case 3:15-cv-03125-RS Document 167-2 Filed 06/21/19 Page 5 of 13

specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page
 that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for
 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
 appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that theDesignating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or otherproceeding, all protected testimony.

8 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other
9 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or
10 containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a
11 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent
12 practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

- 5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's
 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a
 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated
 in accordance with the provisions of this Order.
- 18

6.

5

6

7

CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality
designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens,
or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a
confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original
designation is disclosed.

6.2 <u>Meet and Confer</u>. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process
by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis for each
challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must

28

1 recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph 2 of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must 3 begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication 4 are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In conferring, the Challenging 5 Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and 6 must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the 7 circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen 8 designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it 9 has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is 10 unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

11 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court 12 intervention, the parties shall follow the discovery dispute resolution procedure set forth Section 2 of 13 the Case Management Scheduling Order, Docket No. 31 in the above-captioned case, subject to 14 modification by the procedures required by any Magistrate Judge who may be assigned by the Court 15 to resolve discovery disputes. The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on 16 the Designating Party. Frivolous designations or challenges, and those made for an improper purpose 17 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the 18 Designating Party or the Challenging Party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to afford the 19 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's 20 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

21

7.

ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 <u>Basic Principles</u>. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or
produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only, or in either of the
two related cases (Case numbers 17-cv-01160-RS and 18-cv-03682-RS) for prosecuting, defending,
or attempting to settle this litigation or either of the two related cases. Such Protected Material may
be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order.
When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of

28

1 section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION). 2 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a 3 secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order. 4 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by 5 the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any 6 information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to: 7 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action or either of the two 8 related actions identified above, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it 9 is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation or either of the two related actions identified above and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" 10 11 that is attached hereto as Exhibit A; 12 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving 13 Party or, if Plaintiffs are the Receiving Party, the named plaintiffs, to whom disclosure is reasonably 14 necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be 15 Bound" (Exhibit A); 16 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is 17 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement 18 to Be Bound" (Exhibit A); 19 (d) the court and its personnel; 20 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and 21 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have 22 signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A); 23 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably 24 necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), 25 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed 26 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately 27 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this 28 7 Stipulated Protective Order, AA Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. APA, Case No. 3:15-cv-03125-RS

Case 3:15-cv-03125-RS Document 167-2 Filed 06/21/19 Page 8 of 13

1	Stipulated Protective Order.
2	(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or
3	other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.
4	8. <u>PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER</u>
5	LITIGATION
6	If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
7	disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party
8	must:
9	(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a
10	copy of the subpoena or court order;
11	(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the
12	other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this
13	Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
14	(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
15	Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.
16	If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena
17	or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL"
18	before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has
19	obtained the Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and
20	expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these
21	provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to
22	disobey a lawful directive from another court.
23	9. <u>A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS</u>
24	LITIGATION
25	(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this
26	action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information produced by Non-Parties in
27	connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.
28	Stipulated Protective Order, AA Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. APA, Case No. 3:15-cv-03125-RS 8

1 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional 2 protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or 7 all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

8 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in 9 this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and 10

11

3

4

5

6

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

12 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14 13 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the 14 Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely 15 seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or 16 control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by 17 the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of 18 seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

19

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

20 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected 21 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order. 22 the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized 23 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) 24 inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this 25 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to 26 Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

27

INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED 11.

28

MATERIAL

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

The inadvertent or unintentional production of material that is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection shall not be deemed a waiver in whole or in part of a party's claim of such privilege or protection.

(a) When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or work product protection, the Receiving Parties promptly shall return to the Producing Party that material and all copies or reproductions thereof, shall destroy all notes or other work product reflecting the contents of such material, and shall delete 9 such material from any litigation-support or other database.

(b) When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently 10 11 produced material is subject to a claim of confidentiality protection, the Receiving Party shall treat 12 that material and all copies or reproductions thereof as confidential and shall make all reasonable 13 efforts to retrieve all copies, if any, of such material disclosed to persons other than those authorized 14 in this Order and to prevent further use or disclosure of confidential information contained therein by 15 such persons.

Nothing herein shall alter a party's obligations under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 16 (c) 17 26(b(5)(A) and (B).

18 (d) Any disputes as to materials covered by this section shall be resolved as provided 19 in Section 6 of this Order.

20 12. MISCELLANEOUS

21 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek 12.1 22 its modification by the court in the future.

23 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order 24 no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any 25 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no 26 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by 27 this Protective Order.

28

1 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party or a 2 court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the 3 public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected 4 Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal 5 pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant 6 to Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing that the 7 Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to 8 protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant 9 to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d) is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information 10 in the public record pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(e) unless otherwise instructed by the court.

11

13.

FINAL DISPOSITION

12 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each 13 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. 14 As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, 15 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether 16 the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written 17 certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) 18 by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material 19 that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, 20 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected 21 Material. Notwithstanding this provision. Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all 22 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, 23 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant 24 and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies 25 that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in 26 Section 4 (DURATION).

- 27 || IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
- 28

Stipulated Protective Order, AA Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. APA, Case No. 3:15-cv-03125-RS

	Case 3:15-cv-03125-RS Document 167-2 Filed 06/21/19 Page 12 of 13	
1		
2	DATED: June 19,2019 /s/ Timothy D. McGonigle	
3	Attorneys for Plaintiff	_
4		
5	DATED: June 19, 2019 /s/ Daniel Rosenthal	
6	Attorneys for Defendant	
7		
8	PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.	
9		
10	DATED:	
11	United States District/Magistrate Judge	
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28	Stipulated Protective Order, AA Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. APA, Case No. 3:15-cv-03125-RS	

1	EXHIBIT A	
2	ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND	
3	I, [print or type full name], of [print or	
4	type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the	
5	Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Northern	
6	District of California on [date] in the case of American Airlines Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. Allied	
7	Pilots Association, Case No. 3:15-cv-03125 RS. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the	
8	terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply	
9	could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I	
10	will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective	
11	Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.	
12	I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Northern	
13	District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even	
14	if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.	
15	I hereby appoint [print or type full name] of	
16	[print or type full address and telephone number] as	
17	my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related	
18	to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.	
19		
20	Date:	
21	City and State where sworn and signed:	
22		
23	Printed name:	
24		
25	Signature:	
26		
27		
28	Stipulated Protective Order, <i>AA Flow-Thru Pilots Coalition v. APA</i> , Case No. 3:15-cv-03125-RS 13	